

THE ROLE OF GENDER IN PARTICIPATORY POLICYMAKING
(The Development of *Tenun Ikat* Industry in Ternate Village Alor Barat Laut District Alor Regency)

Amon Djobo⁽¹⁾; Aloysius Liliweri⁽²⁾; Ajis Salim Adang Djaha⁽³⁾

Administration Sciences Master Program, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences
Universitas Nusa Cendana Kupang, Nusa Tenggara Timur, Indonesia
e-mail: amondjobo061@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

This research aimed to analyze and describe the gender role in participatory policymaking for Small Industries Center Development at Alor Barat Laut District. This research employed a qualitative approach and case study method. The researchers performed the study at Alor Barat Laut District, Alor Regency, Nusa Tenggara Timur, Indonesia. The researchers chose Alor Barat Laut District as the Alor Regency Government (2019 - 2024) established a small industry development strategy in Alor Regency Regional Mid Term Development Plan (*Rencana Pembangunan Jangka Menengah Daerah - RPJMD*). The research focus was the gender role in participatory policy making. The research sub-focuses are: (1) the role of men and women in past policy-making, (2) the role of men and women in current policy-making, and (3) the role of men and women in future policy-making. The data collection used in-depth interviews, documentation, and observation. The data analysis used Robert Yin's pattern-matching analysis technique visualization. The researchers used the triangulation technique to validate research findings.

The research result showed that women were dominant in the past decision-making of the *tenun ikat* industry. Men were viewed as the inhibiting factor of business development. The women performed the majority of household chores and *tenun ikat* production. In the past, housewives bartered the *tenun ikat* products in the traditional market. Therefore, the development and preservation of *tenun ikat* were entrusted to the women. However, men bartered earthen pottery for cotton from other regions (generally from Flores). In addition, the men (boat masters) carried the *tenun ikat* products to the traditional markets. The women entrusted the men with procuring material and transporting products as they tended to perform domestic roles.

Keywords: Gender, Policy, Participatory, Weaving, Alor

INTRODUCTION

The most developed Processing Industry in Alor Regency is small industries or households. On the other hand, medium to large industries did not contribute to Alor Regency's economy. The industrial sector relies on household activity and therefore has a small scope. The household industry produces small amounts of food, beverages, woven products, and services. Therefore, the industry's turnover tends to be small. Alor Regency can use the processing industry's potential as a source of income.

The processing industry's contribution to Gross Regional Domestic Product (GRDP) gradually increases. However, the contribution tends to fluctuate. In 2017,

the processing industry's contribution to GRDP reached 1.46%. In 2018, however, the contribution value decreased by 0.02% (1.44%). In 2019, the contribution value increased by 0.02% (1.46%). Due to the gradually increasing GRDP value, the processing industry sector has significant development potential. As the processing industry is mainly conducted on a household scale, it is necessary to empower human resources to improve competitiveness in the millennial era. Furthermore, the products of the processing industry may be sold at a competitive price and therefore benefits the household businessmen (Economic Indicator of Alor Regency, 2019).

The Gender Development Index (*Indeks Pembangunan Gender - IPG*) and Gender Empowerment Index (*Indeks Pemberdayaan Gender - IDG*) showed that women's economic empowerment is correlated to industrial data in the Alor Barat Laut District. The villages in Alor Barat Laut District showed feminine and masculine roles in the household industry. The feminine role is dominant in the household industry, such as cake or bread, crackers, and *tenun ikat*. Masculine role is dominant in brick and concrete brick, wooden and bamboo furniture, tire repairs, and other industries.

The division in micro/small industries (household) development shows that male human resources dominate in some industries, while female human resources dominate in other industries. The role division is related to prevailing culture: men may not perform work that women do, and vice versa. However, the culture mentioned above raised several questions: Do men and women have autonomy in the role division? Which gender is dominant in the role division? Do the men and women divide work together? The role division may differ depending on the place, time, culture, and cultural shift in the community. This research offers varied gender roles in decision-making.

In the public sector, decisions and policy-making at the village level (micro/small industry development) are influenced by patriarchal culture. However, there may be a balanced role between men and women. In this research, the balanced role between men and women during decision-making in the domestic and public sectors is considered participatory decision/policy making. Therefore, the researchers studied the role of genders in participatory policymaking in the Alor Barat Laut District. This research aimed to analyze and describe the role of gender in participatory policy-making related to the small industry center development in Alor Barat Laut District, Alor Regency, Nusa Tenggara Timur Province of Indonesia.

REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

Participatory Policymaking

Public policy is "...each decision made by the nation as a strategy to realize the country's objective". Public policy is a strategy to guide the community at the beginning phase, aid the community during the transition period, and aim to create an ideal community (Nugroho, 2012:123). Nugroho (2012:119-122) states several definitions of public policy based on several researchers. Carl I. Friedrich (1963) defines public policy as a chain of action proposed by an individual, group, or government in a particular environment due to existing threats and opportunities. The policies aim to utilize existing potential, deter inhibitors and achieve specific objectives.

The researchers chose both definitions of policymaking to support the study on participatory policymaking related to small industry center development. Participatory policymaking refers to a chain of action proposed by an individual, group, or

government based on existing threats and opportunities in a certain environment. In this research, the environment referred to small or household industry center development such as the *tenun ikat* industry at Buaya Island and Ternate Island. The village government involved the housewives and female teenagers group in decision-making related to *tenun ikat* industry center developments. The village government aimed to realize Alor Regency Government Regency Regional Long Term Development Plan (*Rencana Pembangunan Jangka Panjang Daerah - RPJPD*) related to small industry development.

RPJPD is a strategy to guide the community in the beginning phase, aid the community in the transition period, and achieve set objectives. The objective referred to the vision of Alor Regency Government RPJPD 2005 - 2025, as set in Regional Regulation No.6 the Year 2009 "Independent, Advanced, Fair, and Prosperous Alor Regency". Alor Regency RPJMD 2019 - 2024 describes the Vision of the Regent and Vice-Regent "Realizing Independent Alor Regency in Human Development Index through Clean and Prestigious Governance". In addition, Alor Regency Government aims to realize a full, healthy, and intelligent community as set in Regional Development Objectives 2019 - 2024 through *Gemma Mandiri*¹ Strategy and *Tancap Gas Spirit*.

Future Policy Forecast

Dunn (2003) explains that forecasting is a procedure to obtain factual information about future social circumstances based on existing policing issues. Forecasting has three primary forms: projections, predictions, and estimation. Projections are a form of forecasting based on explorations of past, present, and future tendencies. Prediction specifies the power of generative (cause) and consequence (effect) or parallel relationship process (analog) that acts as a basis of a relationship. Estimation is a form of forecasting based on an informative or expert evaluation of future circumstances in a community.

Each forecasting has a certain objective. Dunn (2003:292-293) states that the most crucial objective of forecasting is to provide information on future policy changes and their consequences. One of the most accurate forecasting tools is qualitative or quantitative research on social and science sectors. Therefore, academic papers are crucial for proposing a regional policy that may affect the community's livelihood. For example, developing small and middle industry centers. Forecasting small industry development - such as *tenun ikat* on the household level - is an effort to formulate appropriate policy.

Policy Making Theory

Anderson in Winarno (2016:90) divided public policymaking and public policy development. Policymaking refers to the effort to solve problems and their participants. Policy development refers to several aspects, such as how public issues garner the attention of policymakers, how policies are proposed for specific problems, and how a particular proposal is chosen among possible alternatives. Policy development is part of policy-making, as policy development analyzes several alternatives for existing problems and participants. Therefore, in this research, policymaking has the exact definition of policy development.

¹ Development plan of Alor Regency, Nusa Tenggara Timur Province, Indonesia

Policymaking uses several models. Winarno (2016:91-110) introduces several public policy-making models such as (1) system model, (2) comprehensive rational model, (3) satisfaction model, (4) incremental model, (5) mixed scanning model, and (6) optimal qualitative model. Wayne Parsons (2006:339) introduces the decision-making and policymaking process through several approaches and models. Decision-making and policy analysis processes use the following approaches: personality, cognition, and information processing. The approach mentioned above introduces seven models of decision making: (1) decision making: behavioral and cognitive context, (2) Lasswel and the psychology of decision making, (3) decision making and group psychology, (4) Simon and cognitive dimension of decision making, (5) Vickers and evaluation system, (6) policy making as steering system: Karl Deutsch and Government Cybernetics, and (7) Decision Psychology: an integrative approach.

Gender

Robert Hellen (Rasyidin, 2014) introduces the term "gender." He divides human features based on the socio-culture definition and biological characteristics. Oakley (1972) states that "gender" entered the international academic sector in the 1970s. Feminist supporters and researchers started to explore the characteristics of gender in the social, political, and economic sectors. In the beginning, the terms "men" and "women" are used universally and represents crucial characteristic and quality of human being.

Oakley (2016) further explains that the concept of gender initially means the difference between men and women (sex) and the different manifestations of masculine and feminine behavior. Women are considered second-class humans compared to men. Roles given to the women in the community tend to lack prestige, for example, housewives and mothers. As these roles do not generate income, women are often underestimated. Sex refers to the different biological organs of men and women, especially the sexual organ for procreation functions. On the other hand, gender refers to the social context. Gender refers to the social classification of men and women in the respective 'masculine and feminine' categories. One of the feminist representatives showed that social gender inequality influenced work division instead of sex. Therefore, gender is the social classification that differentiates humans into masculine or feminine beings. Gender is the classification principle in community and culture.

Masculinity is a male stereotype that contrasts femininity with a female stereotype. Masculine and femininity are two opposing poles possessing contrasting characteristics. The pole describes the degree of masculinity or femininity. A man possessing characteristics identical to the masculinity stereotype is called masculine. However, a man possessing more masculine characteristics is called super-masculine. Furthermore, a man possessing a less masculine character is called a feminine man. The degree of femininity works similarly. Masculinity or femininity stereotype covers several aspects such as individual character (behavior and personality), role, occupation, physical appearance, and sexual orientation (Brod, Harry-ed,1987).

RESEARCH METHOD

This research used a qualitative approach and case study method. The researchers conducted the study in Alor Barat Laut District, Alor Regency, Nusa Tenggara Timur Province, Indonesia. The researchers chose Alor Barat Laut District as the Alor

Regency Government (2019 - 2024) established a small industry development strategy in Alor Regency RPJMD. The research focus was the role of gender in public policy-making. The research sub-focus is: (1) the role of men and women in past policymaking, (2) the role of men and women in present policymaking, and (3) the role of men and women in future policymaking. The data collection used in-depth interviews, documentation, and observation. The data analysis used Robert Yin's (1996) pattern-matching analysis technique visualization and Miles and Huberman's (1992) cross-site or case analysis techniques. The researchers used the triangulation technique to validate research findings.

RESEARCH FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

The weavers could hardly market their products as the women could only work part-time. The women weave and market their products at the same time. As a result, women spend time in the markets to promote their products. Therefore, if third-party markets *tenun ikat* products, the women may focus on their weaving and improve their productivity. The time used in the marketing process influenced productivity level. F.W. Taylor (in Robbins, 1997) studied time, movement, and productivity level. F.W. Taylor established Scientific Management Theory - which focused on time and mission study. The research result supported the theory that time and movement influenced productivity.

Based on research findings, there are several policy alternatives to improve the household industry (in this case, *tenun ikat*). One of the *tenun ikat* development policies is (1) *Tenun Ikat* organization at the village level; (2) Managing *tenun ikat* group as an organization; and (3) Production quantity.

1. *Tenun Ikat* Organization. To empower the village community, in this case, the *tenun ikat* industry, most housewives established the *tenun ikat* organization. The organization consists of a chairman, secretary, treasury, and members. The organization manages existing human resources and improves production effectiveness and efficiency. Furthermore, it is necessary to divide work to improve productivity, such as logistics, production, and marketing. Some members may focus on logistics (purchase and store material), while others may focus solely on production. Furthermore, assigning some organization members to market the products is necessary. In short, good organizational management may develop the *tenun ikat* industry. Therefore, future empowerment programs need to improve existing organizations at the village level. Empowering *tenun ikat* through organizational or institutional development must adhere to organizational values. Henry Fayol in Robbins (1997:39-40) describes that an organization requires clear work division and authority, members working in unison and maintaining discipline, and shared common goals between members and leaders. In addition, the organization needs to have clear remuneration principles, a chain of command, and regulation. The organization needs to implement the principles of fairness, have a clear incentive, and guarantee esprit de corps. Fayol states that paying attention to organizational principles will improve the effectiveness and efficiency of the *tenun ikat* organization.
2. Business Management. Organizational development needs to implement several management functions. Several management experts have stated several functions to improve the effectiveness and efficiency of organizations. Efficient means that *tenun ikat* organization must use existing resources to obtain the most optimal result. Effectiveness refers to an organization's ability to achieve set objectives; how an organization uses input, process, output, and feedback

components; how an organization generates organizational satisfaction for members and stakeholders; and how an organization can compete with other organizations in the same sector. George R. Terry (in Robbins 1997) suggests that organizations need to implement the following functions: planning, organizing, implementing, and supervising. Luther Gulick (in Harmon and suggested Mayer 2014:171) POSDCORB (Planning, organizing, staffing, directing, coordinating, reporting, dan budgeting). Therefore, the *tenun ikat* organization must adhere to organizational principles and management functions. *Tenun ikat* organization needs to involve women in the policymaking process. The women tend to dominate the development of the *tenun ikat* industry and manage the family members in the household industry. The men tend to listen to the women and perform their tasks willingly. The men realize that the household industry fulfills basic needs and funds children's education. In short, women (housewives) have a more dominant role in household decision-making than men (in terms of fulfilling basic needs). However, women need more initiative and influence in public sector decision-making. Due to cultural values, women tend to have no courage to speak up in the public sector in front of men. For example, three prospective female Village Development Agency (*Badan Pembangunan Desa - BPD*) members failed the election due to the lack of votes. The *tenun ikat* industry must implement the aforementioned organizational principles and management functions. Weavers have joined *tenun ikat* organizations. However, the organizations themselves need clear work divisions. Each of the members performed logistics, production, and marketing tasks on their own. Due to the individualistic nature of the work, the *tenun ikat* industry did not generate significant income.

3. Quantity (total production). The *tenun ikat* industry needs more production quantity. Instead of a limited productivity level, the industry needs more time and movement usage. The weavers are generally housewives and busy with household chores such as cooking, laundry, etc. Household chores tend to take a long time and have slow production time. In addition to household chores, the weavers need to market their products. Generally, one *sarung* may take up to 2-3 days to produce. However, a weaver could only produce one *sarung* weekly due to household chores and marketing activity. George R. Terry suggests that time and movement influence the productivity level of an industry or business. Reducing other activities and focusing on one activity is necessary to improve the weavers' productivity. Therefore, a clear work division may improve work effectiveness and efficiency.

The *tenun ikat* industry needs to involve Village Owned Enterprise (*Badan Usaha Milik Desa - BUMDes*) to increase productivity and market their product. BUMDes potentially develop the *tenun ikat* industry using a modern management system. BUMDes may provide logistic and marketing services, allowing the weavers to focus on production effectively and efficiently. The weavers may use the provided space for work or continue working at home, then submit their products to BUMDes. BUMDes can extend the marketing network to other cities, regencies, and provinces. The network expansions refer to business spaces such as galleries in Kalabahi, Kupang City, or other regencies in Nusa Tenggara Timur. In addition to galleries inside and outside Nusa Tenggara Timur, BUMDes uses websites for marketing the *tenun ikat* products online.

Furthermore, the *tenun ikat* industry may need to involve the Regional Craft Council of Indonesia (*Dewan Kerajinan Nasional Daerah - Dekranasda*), Industry and Trade Agency, Cooperative Agency, and Small-Middle Enterprise (SME). The

aforementioned Regional Organizations (*Organisasi Perangkat Daerah* - OPD) facilitate marketing by establishing a network connecting *tenun ikat* groups, cooperatives, companies, or galleries. However, OPD tends to buy *tenun ikat* products, encouraging dependency instead of fostering independence.

Tenun ikat industry often needs help procuring raw materials, production, and marketing. The village head, village officials, chairman, and BPD members know of the problem. The weavers, *tenun ikat* group, village government, and BPD need to overcome the existing problem by paying attention to existing strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, and threats in the context of public policy. Carl I. Friedrich (in Nugroho 2012) defines public policy as a chain of action proposed by an individual, group, or government in a certain environment based on existing opportunities and threats. The proposed policy utilizes existing potential and deters inhibitors to achieve a set of objectives.

Struman (in Winarno 2016:46) states that the *tenun ikat* groups have the same interest and need to address the following issues: raw material procurement, limited workforce, and marketing difficulty. The *tenun ikat* group must compete with the farmer, fisher, and stock farmer groups in public policymaking. The village government and BPD need to formulate public policy that accommodates community interest and quells conflicts of interest. Village government may manage conflict of interest through: (1) Formulating regulations, (2) Regulate compromise and balancing conflicting interests, (3) Turning compromise into public policy, (4) Enforce the compromise.

However, Carl I. Friedrich and Struman's suggestions are not implemented on the village level. The *tenun ikat* group often presents their problem to other parties such as Regency Government, Provincial Government, Village Government, BPD, and the researchers. At the very least, the Village Government should formulate appropriate policies to solve existing problems. For example, work division in organizations or institutions.

Ternate Village shows the following problem regarding participatory policymaking:

1. How to manage existing human resources to improve production levels? There are enough human resources as the fishermen work part-time. The fishermen capture fish around Ternate Island merely as a source of food. The fishermen could use their free time to finish *tenun ikat* products. However, the prevailing cultural values prevent the men from working in the *tenun ikat* industry, causing the men to shy away from doing the women's work. The village government needs to hold a discussion that involves the men and women, encouraging the men to participate in the *tenun ikat* industry. However, a third party needs to facilitate the discussion to encourage the women to present their opinion in front of the men. On the other hand, men need to suppress their pride and participate in productive activities.
2. How to build a network to market products? The women tend to procure raw materials, produce *tenun ikat*, and market products independently. Therefore, it is necessary to facilitate the woman through procuring raw materials and product marketing. BUMDes may assist in procuring raw materials, such as various types of thread and dyes. In doing so, the women may save time instead of traveling to Kabalahi City to procure threads and dyes. Furthermore, BUMDes may assist in marketing *tenun ikat* products as well. BUMDes cooperates with various parties to market *tenun ikat* products. Facilitating raw material procurement and product marketing will ultimately improve productivity levels.

However, addressing the aforementioned suggestions in a village forum is necessary before formulating appropriate policies. Village forums must involve men and women to address the existing problem and create appropriate policies that satisfy all stakeholders.

3. How to guarantee the availability of raw materials in the village? BUMDes can procure raw materials such as threads, dye, and other supporting components. Therefore, women can focus on production. In addition, Village level policy is necessary to encourage cooperation between *tenun ikat* weavers, BUMDes, and Village Government. The policymaking needs to involve related parties, including the women as *tenun ikat* weavers.

The *tenun ikat* weavers have presented the aforementioned three problems. However, the related governments need to formulate appropriate policies to develop the *tenun ikat* industry. The main factor that inhibits policymaking is the ability and willingness of the village officials. The ability refers to intellect, knowledge, and skills from work experience. However, willingness played a crucial role in policy-making as well. Village officials and BPD need to have adequate knowledge, skill, and willingness to formulate policies that benefit the *tenun ikat* industry in Ternate Village. The policies must involve related parties and stakeholders to develop the *tenun ikat* industry.

Several factors inhibit gender roles in decision-making. The main inhibiting factor is **the patriarchal culture** in the village community. The patriarchal culture influence thinking, attitude, and behavioral pattern. The women think that public discussion belongs to the realm of men. The women may present their problems to the discussion but never be part of the decision-making process. On the other hand, the men think that *tenun ikat* is part of women's jobs. Performing women's jobs would decrease a man's prestige in the community. The second inhibiting factor is that Village Government and BPD do not consider *tenun ikat* industry development as a crucial public issue. Therefore, the village government and BPD must actively formulate appropriate policies to develop the *tenun ikat* industry. The village government and BPD need to understand village management authority as presented in Law No.6 of 2014 regarding Villages. Village Government and BPD need to be innovative in managing various social and economic problems and formulating appropriate policies.

CONCLUSION

Based on the findings, the researchers drew the following conclusions:

1. The research result showed that women were dominant in the past decision-making related to *tenun ikat* industry development. Men were viewed as the inhibiting factor of business development. The women performed the majority of household chores and *tenun ikat*. In the past, housewives bartered the *tenun ikat* products in the traditional market. Therefore, the development and preservation of *tenun ikat* were entrusted to the women. However, the men bartered earthen pottery for cotton from other regions (generally from Flores) and carried *tenun ikat* products to the traditional markets. The women entrusted the men to carry out the activities as they tended to perform domestic roles.
2. The gender role in present decision-making. Currently, the gender role tends to shift as the men start to participate in *tenun ikat* activity (the finishing phase). However, the participation was limited to the domestic sector (household) instead of the public sector. Due to cultural values, men shy away

from participating in the public sector. In this case, working in the *tenun ikat* industry would reduce men's prestige and social status. However, the men gradually warm up to the *tenun ikat* industry to fulfill basic needs and fund children's education. Furthermore, there are social needs (community solidarity) such as weddings, building houses and places of worship, and community members' death that requires money. As the *tenun ikat* industry manages to cover some of the household needs, husbands are willing to participate in the industry. However, the Ternate Village government has not implemented policies and regulations related to the *tenun ikat* industry development.

3. The gender role in future decision-making. *Tenun ikat* industry needs to implement organization principles and management functions and utilize the existing internal and external potential. Internal potency refers to BUMDes. External potency refers to OPD and related *tenun ikat* SMEs. The management needs to adhere to existing laws and regulations.
4. Supporting and inhibiting factors influencing the *tenun ikat* industry. The supporting factor refers to the gender role shift in the *tenun ikat* industry due to household needs. Despite households having increasing needs, however, villages have small opportunities to offer. In addition, OPDs offer opportunities for men to participate in the *tenun ikat* industry. The aforementioned factors encourage the gender role shift in the *tenun ikat* industry. The inhibiting factors refer to cultural values. The men shy away from participating in *tenun ikat* industry development, as it would reduce their prestige and social standing. In addition, women are reluctant to participate in public discussions. Furthermore, the village government and BPD need more understanding, knowledge, and willingness to develop the *tenun ikat* industry.

SUGGESTION

1. There must be empowerment programs to manage prevailing cultures that inhibit development and motivate the community to develop healthy work culture. The empowerment program may promote and quicken village development. It is necessary to study cultural values that support and inhibit village development. The village and regency government can use the mapping result to foster and develop cultural values that support the development process.
2. The management of the existing *tenun ikat* organization must be based on organizational principles and management functions. Training on group or organization life will be necessary to promote members' understanding of their rights and obligations and encourage the leaders to understand and perform their work. Good management and training processes will promote small industries' development, in this case, *tenun ikat*. Furthermore, it is necessary to improve raw material procurement, productivity level, and marketing process. The industry needs to increase cotton farms inside the village and reach out to other regions to procure raw materials regularly. BUMDes may facilitate thread and dye to improve the *tenun ikat* industry productivity. *Tenun ikat* industry needs to adhere to organizational principles and management functions correctly. Furthermore, the industry needs to establish an effective and efficient marketing network. Village government, BUMDes, cooperatives, and SMEs must collaborate to distribute the products.

3. Training for village government and BPD will allow them to identify public issues that require policymaking. Each villager, be it men or woman, need to be able to identify public issues, create a priority list of public issues, and formulate appropriate policy. It is necessary to involve women in policy-making, especially those related to the *tenun ikat* industry, as the women know the working of the *tenun ikat* industry. Furthermore, the women can identify what the industry needs. The village government can refer to the priority list to formulate policies. In addition, the regency government may use the priority list as supervision and evaluation material.

REFERENCES

1. Nugroho, Riant. 2012. Public Policy. Kompas Gramedia. Jakarta.
2. Friedrich Carl J. 1963. Man and His Government. Mc Graw-Hill. Newyork.
3. Dunn, William N. 2003. Pengantar Analisis Kebijakan Publik. Gajah Mada University. Yogyakarta.
4. Winarno. 2013. Pembelajaran Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan Isi, Strategi, dan Penelitian. Bumi Aksara. Jakarta.
5. Rasyidin, W. 2014. Pedagogis Teoritis dan Praktis. Remaja Rosdakarya. Bandung.
6. Oakley, A. 1972. Sex, Gender, and Society. Tample Smith. London.
7. Brod, Harry (ed). 1987. "The Making of Masculinities, The New Men's Studies". Allen & Unwin. Boston.
8. Yin, Robert K. 1996. Studi Kasus: Desain dan Metode. Rajagrafindo Persada. Jakarta.
9. Miles, B. Mathew dan Michael Huberman. 1992. Analisis Data Kualitatif Buku Sumber Tentang Metode-metode Baru. UIP. Jakarta.
10. Robbins, Stephen P. 1997. Perilaku Organisasi: Konsep, Kontroversi, Aplikasi. Edisi Bahasa Indonesia. Jilid 1. PT. Prehallindo. Jakarta.
11. Harmon, Michael M & Mayer Richard T. 2014. Teori Organisasi Untuk Administrasi Publik. Kreasi Wacana. Bantul.